OPERATIONAL ANALYSIS

WAR BETWEEN THE STATES Building the Blue Tide and the Gray Levee

by Jeffrey M. Bishop

War Between the States seems to be one of those rare big games that people actually play. I am just now beginning to experience the round of articles that results from such playing — and since Mr. Bishop was one of the first to submit sensible copy on this rather large entanglement, he gets his published. Readers are advised to peruse the preceding follow-up article first — and understand that Mr. Bishop did not write with the benefit of that information. — RAS

With the introduction of WBTS, the "monster gamer" has at last found a contest to sate his appetite for large scale grand strategy without having to structure the rest of his life around it. To be sure, WBTS is big, but it is not on nearly the same scale as WIEu or WITW. The following observations describe the strategic and economic plausibilities that are available to each player in this gamer's game.

Game Components

Initially, one must be familiar with all the weapons that are available to wield. Below is a unit by unit summary which can assist you in deciding what to build and for what purpose:







Infantry Infantry comes in three flavors: garrison, militia, and regulars. Each has its own advantages and disadvantages and should be built and employed with that in mind. (a) Militia are quickly produced, requiring only a single cycle, but they are heir to certain drawbacks. Moderately expensive in Personnel Points (the source of which rapidly dries up), they are slow marchers, and, if militia demobilization strikes, 50% of your army may decide that states rights "ain't so important anyhow." Although they can be combined and split at will (CFYD -Change-For-Your-Dollar, the maximum strength point size per counter is a paltry four, which makes an effective force totally unmanageable. They are, as shall be delineated later, a most important commodity nonetheless. (b) Garrisons are the cheapest in Personnel Points, but they require more time for construction. They are very slow and can be moved effectively only by rail. Their advantages are CFYD and their availability in values up to 20 SP's per unit. The special Confederate Replacement Rule makes them particularly attractive after 1862, since they may convert directly into regulars. (c) Regulars are, of course, the backbone of both armies. They are comparatively fast marchers, can be built up to 10 SP's per unit, and never evaporate by demobilization. Their disadvantage is the extreme cost involved in building them from scratch, requiring four cycles and three Personnel Points per SP. Additionally, they can split off brigade-sized units and combine brigades into a division only during the Strategic Turn. The loss of regulars should not be taken lightly; rather, use militia whenever possible to absorb losses (insofar as the rules permit). [See WBTS compiled errata is this issue.]



Cavalry Stuart and Grierson ride again with swift cavalry maneuvers that can often set the balance of a game completely atilt. Cavalry comes in brigades and divisions. They are, of course, the swiftest ground units and are useful for lightning raids deep into enemy territory, given the right leader. Although expensive to build, one must seriously consider a moderate cav' force; and if your opponent starts throwing some about the map, you had better counter by including some in your production.





River Transports and Flotillas These units are absolute necessities for the Union player and of slightly less importance to the Confederate. The war in the west revolves entirely around the Mississippi River early in the game, and lack of riverine units means no progress for the Yank. The Gray commander will usually be faced with a large enemy armada within eight months of the beginning of hostilities, but he should try nevertheless to keep something afloat until Union control is irrevocable.





Naval Transports and Flotillas are perhaps the greatest Union asset in that they maintain control of the high seas. The Federal player should build every one that is available as soon as possible. Amphibious landings and blockades will advance the Blue cause greatly, as the only conceivable adversary to the Union Naval units are the Confederate Ironclads.



Ironclads Although desirable to have in one's arsenal, they will probably be short-lived (given an aggressive Yank) or never appear (given bad die rolls). And they are expensive to build. Except as a last ditch effort to pierce a blockade, they are probably better left in the counter tray.



Siege Trains Essential for the Yank and non-existent for the Rebs, these counters are slow and costly, but well worth the effort when the Union ball gets rolling. Eventually, Confederate forts will be popping up like mushrooms, and taking double losses during storms is too much like Fredericksburg for my tastes. Additionally, with a bit of prudence in their deployment, you need only construct them once. A good mid-game build.





Forts and Fortresses These units are absolute necessities for the Confederate and, to a lesser extent, for the Union. The South must defend fixed geographical objectives in a game where movement is their forte. Thus the high-priced and chancy business of engineering must go on. For the Federal player, it is well to keep in mind that — even though it's unlikely that Lee will romp into Washington at any time — since the Supply Points are there, you should give yourself some peace of mind by fortifying your major cities. Also, it's an easy way to blockade Southern ports.

5 HO Potomc 0-3

Corps and Army HQs These are the indispensible organization pieces necessary for either side to mount any type of real threat on enemy territory. For example: Fightin' Joe Hooker can move up to 20 SPs of supplied regulars, or 30 unsupplied, by himself. With a Corps HQ, his capacity increases to 40 supplied or 50 unsupplied SPs — a considerable increase.

An Army HQ is certainly valuable, particularly if a good leader is available to command it. Oddly enough, the Union has the advantage in highest initiative Army commanders.





4-5-2

Supply Trains and Depots These represent logistic elements for each army and prove to be imperative for any advance. Both players should produce supply trains in sufficient numbers for mobile supply, while the siting of depots is much more tricky. Any inland advance by the Union player will depend upon a string of depots to maintain the supply and communication essential for an effective campaign. Confederate depots will be primarily built as defensive measures in target cities.

Leaders No doubt leaders are the crux of this game. Basically the contest comes down to a rencontre between Union and

Confederate commanders. It is by their initiative that all the aforementioned forces (except Naval and River Craft — perhaps a Porter and Farragut could be included?) are able to move and fight. As befits history, the South has an edge here, and the Union early game is thus dependent on the acquisition of a decent leader who can get his troops in the field. (More on this under the Union and Confederate Strategy topics.)

Union Strategic Approaches

The Yankee should divide his game into three periods: (a) the build-up and consolidation period; (b) the advance in the west and diminution of the Confederate economy; and (c) all-out advance. The first phase will last at least to the end of 1861 and probably several cycles into 1862, during which the Federal must be content to maintain the integrity of his own borders while building up strength for a long war of attrition. To be sure, one must realize that there are no

glorious lopsided victories, no complete annihilations of Southern armies, (i.e., no D Elims against any sizeable force). The CRT is structured such that, at any odds level, a superior force will suffer virtually as many losses as an inferior force, sometimes even more! But don't despair, as your army is considerably less brittle than that of your opponent. Which brings us up to the composition of your forces.

Infantry The Union Personnel Points are in sufficient abundance to build regulars directly. However, with the investment of one additional cycle and two-thirds the normal Personnel Point costs, you can build the same amount of regulars via militia conversion. The game is very long, and you don't need to take the field offensively (and probably shouldn't) until six to eight cycles have passed. So, crank out militia and put them back into production, and watch the 10-3s multiply like flies. As to garrison troops, it may behoove you to put 20 SPs or so in

Notes on Production

Union Union production should concentrate on producing an effective (read numerous) group of regulars rapidly and cheaply. This generally means the conversion of less exepensive infantry types. Given the Union militia on the map at the start and 10 SPs coming up on the first cycle, approximately 20 regulars can be produced by 11/61. Unfortunately for your production scheme, however, a Militia Demobilization pops up on the 8/61 cycle. Thus, it may be advantageous to forego militia builds during 7/61, as half of them may evaporate as soon as they are deployed. Produce garrisons instead and then switch to militia.

The normal costs for the forces in the accompanying "Typical Production Scheme," if built from scratch, would be 660 Personnel Points, whereas actual costs were 550 PPs, for a savings of 110 Personnel Points — the value of which need not be pointed out when you look at the PP allotment on the first month of the First Volunteer Call.

A further advantage of this system is the excellent balance which is given to your army as a whole, even during the initial months of the war. Besides having ground forces of over 246,000 men, your navy consists of over 14 units (including freebies).

In your further production, it will benefit you to continue builds and conversion of militia and garrisons as they become superfluous in rear areas, especially during the early months of a new volunteer call or draft. The last two months can be devoted to conversions and naval and logistics builds.

Finally, when your army becomes sufficiently large to allow it, withdraw de-

pleted divisions and augment them. This is a very inexpensive way to bring back those big 10-3's but, as mentioned, such a procedure is rarely possible early in the game when every regular division, regardless of size, is needed at the front.

Confederate You are on the strategic defensive, with interior lines for communication and supply, and you should realize the eventual impossibility of maintaining a naval fleet. In light of these conditions, your production aims are simplified. You must produce and maintain a standing army post haste, using as few Personnel Points as possible per SP, plus provide them with logistic support. Thus, your builds will essentially be directed at producing regulars, supply trains, cavalry, and an occasional river flotilla or transport.

Militia conversion is a virtual necessity during the first two years of the war in lieu of your limited PPs (340 in the first seven cycles as opposed to 460 for the Union). Since you will probably get only limited use from your non-ground units, at least 90 percent of your first volunteer call should go into cavalry and infantry, with the latter getting the lion's share. Militia conversion and garrison builds can turn 260 PPs into 110 regulars (73 from scratch) and 40 garrison SPs, while another 60 PPs can produce 20 cavalry SPs. The remainder can be used for supply trains and gunboats. With this approach, you can maintain numerical nearparity in field forces for the better part of a year, in addition to producing a modest river navy.

Don't be afraid to call for more volunteers either. Unless you carry away a stunning reversal of history by taking Federal forts or isolating cities, you will probably never be on the plus side of the Political Point level, so one or two PPs probably won't make a difference. Even so, when you announce the second Confederate Volunteer Call, your opponent's paranoia will probably precipitate an additional call on his part as well.

Lastly, use the Special Confederate Replacement rule for all it's worth. After 1862, each Personnel Point is a potential regular. This can go far toward getting you back into the thick of things. Build garrisons exclusively, and always withdraw a corps to a nearby department—east, southeast, and west just before cycle.



Other Builds Ironclads, RR repair units, and bases are all quite costly in supply points and, with the possible exception of RR units, of rather dubious value. Bases are needed only if you are planning amphibious operations or if you've no place else to deploy a river unit. But amphib is pretty much out of the question, and if the Yank has such good control of the waters to have taken all your riverside cities, a boat is superfluous at best. (One of those non-existent Confederate siege trains could conceivably come in more handy.) Ironclads are too expensive and chancy to rely on. Besides, they draw a great deal of attention and will probably be sunk shortly after deployment. RR repair units can be useful when Union rail cutting gets under way. One in the east and one in the west may be of value. Consider them a mid-game build.

Washington and half that number in the other major cities of the North.

Cavalry Historically, this branch of the service was inefficient and, in many ways, superfluous to the Northern army. In the game though, they are as good as their Confederate counterparts and may secure the Union victory. As will be described later, a Confederate cavalry raid can wreak havoc on Northern communications and tie up troops better used elsewhere. So spend a few points and build up a decent cavalry to hunt them down (and hope that Sheridan pops up early). Or if nothing else, build 1-4 brigades and stack them with infantry units which can force march to cut down gray cavalry.

Naval units Start constructing your navy as early as supply availability makes it practical — say, about three to four cycles after hostilities begin — with river units appearing first to clear the Mississippi. If a Southern gunboat shows itself, leap on it and pound. You can replace your losses, while your opponent is hard-pressed to do so. On cycles five and six, begin your high seas fleet, one or two at a time, until they are all present. They are of inestimable value to the Union and are practically invulnerable.

HQs These should be distributed in roughly equal proportion between the east and west, perhaps favoring the west where an organized army will be of paramount significance during mid-game. The first Army HQ is best placed in the west, where most of the action will begin, although paranoia may prompt its deployment in the east.

Forts and Fortresses These should be constructed in major cities. Washington being the primary site for a fortress, of course. After that, it depends on where your advances are made, but remember the blockade requirements of each Southern port as pertaining to forts and satisfy them as soon as possible.

Depots and Supply Trains Four or five Supply trains should suffice early in the game, since most of your supply can be carried by water. But combat supply is another matter. Keep your main forces stocked with a healthy supply train at all times. The results of contrary actions can be appalling.

Depot construction is rarely called for in the west until inland operations commence, although re-stocking supply trains from depots may be advantageous. Build a depot in every major northern city as a safeguard against siege attrition, likely or not.

Commanders Finally one must consider the bane of the Union cause. Even the most bloodthirsty Rebel will feel some remorse at the frustration incurred by the Yank during the Movement Phase. But don't be discouraged. Eventually a pair of commanders will show up to move the massive armies that you are building. At any rate, put your best leader in charge in the west, and get pokey McClellan back east where sedentary habits are not nearly as damaging. If nothing else. he can direct several units to move when given the initiative to do so. Attack from March can also be an effective McClellan maneuver. And if Grant and Sherman are both on the map, bring Sherman east, and watch the Confederate hopes flicker. As to the rest, 60 percent are best left to garrison duty, minor sideshows, and odd jobs. Also, even your worst leaders make excellent corps commanders under Grant, Sherman, or Meade, since they needn't do anything but exist. Try to keep a 3 initiative leader in eastern Ohio and in the St. Louis-Cairo area to repel or hunt down raiders.

Don't expose your commanders to combat unless the situation is exceedingly desperate or if his capture is imminent. A live leader — even with an initiative of 1 — is better than no leader at all. A captured leader is worse than anything. Take the "Lonely Leader" rules to heart, and do it only under the safest of conditions.

Lastly, if you plan ever again to see besieged units anywhere else on the map, don't neglect to put a leader in with them. There are no leaderless Attacks from March, and a single brigade can lay siege to a fort of 10 SPs and bottle them up until attrition takes its toll or a relief force arrives.

Union Mid-Game Strategic Objectives

Now that your army is ready, it's time to reunite the United States. First and foremost — don't break Kentucky neutrality. The 50 Personnel Points are bad enough, but the strategic can of worms that such a move opens can cost you heavily. Although it may open up your advances on the Mississippi and Tennessee Rivers (which, of course, are highest priority), it also gives you a very long border to guard. Use it as a shield just as the Confederate player does.

The first step in securing the Mississippi will likely be Union City, which should be grabbed quickly. A Confederate fort may be there, but don't let that deter you as it is the jumping-off point necessary for any Blue advance on Memphis and beyond. Once this objective is secured, the advance and siege of Memphis is called for, claiming or repairing rails as the campaign proceeds. Thus, 1862 should close with Memphis in hand and half the Mississippi cleared of the Southern navy and, if practicable, the seizure of New Orleans by troops aboard naval transports under a reliable leader. Savannah is also a likely 1862 target, along with any other east coast port that can be grabbed.

The better part of 1863 will be spent in capturing Vicksburg, Port Hudson, and the rest of the Mississippi. Another force should be directed at the capture of Nashville to complete the sweep of western cities. With rail cuts at Mobile and Lynchburg (or anywhere between there and Knoxville), the supply from western cities will never appear in Confederate coffers. The last remaining ports should be blockaded by forts or warships by mid-1863 as well, thereby slowing down your opponent's supply to a trickle.

With the arrival of 1864, the Federal army should be essentially complete and, let us say, adequately led. The time for the big push is at hand. If Grant is present and Sherman is not, the drive on Richmond takes precedent over the march to the sea. Not only is it demoralizing for the Confederacy, it's considerably closer and less likely to be interdicted by supply raiders. Once Richmond is in hand, which may take the better part of 1864 due to entrenchment rules (hello to WWI), the war is essentially over by historical victory.

Confederate Strategic Approaches

The Confederacy is initially faced with a war of maneuver which all too soon becomes a war of attrition, the style of which it can ill afford. Thus, as at Gettysburg, the first day — or in this case, the first 10 cycles — are of tantamount importance. The Confederate must strike early, while numbers are comparatively equal, using a force which represents his only edge — the cavalry. One or two effective Morganesque raids can net bundles of Political Points which can turn into a Confederate Kentucky or Missouri or, better yet,

С	R	G	M	ST		NF	NT	RF	RT		GU	
5	11	32	0	1	0	0	1	1	0	10	0	7/61
5	1	30	12	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	8/61
3	0	0	30	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	9/61
3	2	10	16	0	0	0	1	1	0	14	0	10/61
0	0	0	20	0	0	0	0	1	0	20	18	11/61
5	0	18	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	38	0	12/61
0	0	0	0	0	0	1	2	1	1	10	0	13/61
0	1	0	42	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	1/62
*Militia I)emobi	lization	†2no	d Volu	nteer C	all						
The resul are as fol		above	produc	ction, (all of w	hich ap	pear by	the 6/	62 cycl	e)		
C	R	G	M	ST	SgT	NF	NT	RF	RT			
21	125	72	28	2	1	1	5	5	3			
Key to A M = M NT = 1	Iilitia; S	ST =	Supply	Train	; SgT	= Sieg	e Train	; NF :	= Nava	al Flotil	la;	filitia

foreign intervention. If the Yank must chase down your horsemen with infantry, your task will be much simplified, and the outcome of such a situation might possibly hand you the game. Such maneuvers can be dangerous, however, if the Union player prepares himself with a cavalry force of his own. If he does, keep your powder dry in readiness for a long grinding war, one which you probably can't win (even though it's fun trying). Even so, you can give him a run for his money by constructing a strong army.

Infantry The tips mentioned previously in regard to the Union go double here. Build militia and convert them into regulars. Your Personnel Point totals are considerably smaller than your opponent's, so get as much out of them as you can. Since numbers are not extremely lopsided early in the game, you can afford to wait the extra cycles to perform conversion. Don't neglect garrisons, either, as they are as effective at holding geographical objectives as regulars (he has to come to you!), as well as being directly convertible into regulars after 1862.

Cavalry You hold a small edge in cavalry units at the start. Maintain it! They are less costly than their Blue counterparts and are entirely worth the expense, as they may be the units to cut off a major Northern city and perhaps live to tell about it, a feat no infantry unit is likely to do. Additionally, single cavalry brigades may be usefully employed behind Union lines to cut communications and isolate cities if Federal cavalry is scarce.

Flotillas and Transports Think about building such things only when supply points are plentiful, as during city supply turns, for instance. They are expensive and usually short-lived given the preponderance of Union strength. By mid-1863, you shouldn't have to worry about them anymore, unless the Union Mississippi campaign has been severely stalled by your other efforts. If your forts are falling or have fallen, your gunboats will follow suit.

Corps and Army HQs These should be apportioned with rough parity between east and west, favoring the east slightly. The eastern coast is close to enemy naval bases, and an effective organization is essential to keep incursions at a minimum. Besides, a disorganized army will be hard-pressed to repel a Union player determined to reach Richmond, even with his mediocre leadership. Ergo, the first Army HQ should be deployed in Richmond.

Forts and Fortresses Forts should be built on all major Southern cities with Richmond converted into a fortress as soon as supply points allow — generally on the first good weather turn of 1862. And, very importantly, get to and fortify Union City first with a sufficiently stocked depot to hold out during a long siege. It must fall eventually, but probably at a great cost in time and personnel to the invader. By mid-1862, the following cities should be fortified: Richmond (fortress), Charleston, Savannah, Mobile, New Orleans, Vicksburg, Memphis, and Nashville. Other forts, built in reaction

to Union thrusts, are best placed on rivers where they can impede naval movement. Remember, however, that fort construction requires the presence of a Department or sufficient supply transported by rail, water, or road. Confederate rail capacity is not up to the job of sending the 40-60 supply points necessary for a good chance of success; thus, your departments must be moved about. Make sure that moving one doesn't expose your troops to hurtful attrition.

Until your forts are directly threatened by extreme superiority in numbers, retain your garrison outside the fort, maintaining a ZOC and conceivably putting off the siege until a later turn.

Supply Trains and Depots The need for mobile supply is as acute for the South as for the North, particularly in the west where the action will be fast moving. As mentioned earlier, depots are best placed in cities which will eventually draw Union troops. Don't make Grant's work any easier by leaving Vicksburg and Memphis fully garrisoned but exposed to attrition. A depot for Fredericksburg can also be useful in keeping the Army of Northern Virginia in beans and hardtack.

Leaders Finally, a bright spot in Southern hopes as we consider the likes of Lee, Longstreet, Jackson, Cleburne, and Beauregard. Confederate commanders give the Southern player the ability to hang in there for as long as he does despite the Union weight of numbers. Initial leaders are Price, Polk, Beauregard, Johnston, and Magruder, (initiatives of 2, 2, 3, 3, and 3) as opposed to Lyons, McClellan, Butler, and McDowell (4, 1, 0!, and 2). The edge is obvious, and it will probably get better. Parcel your leaders to insure a 3 initiative in every corner of the map - namely Northern Virginia, North Carolina, S.C.-Fla.-Ga., and Miss.-Ala., and Tennessee. If nothing else, you will have a force in your area moving at least half the time, which is more than your opponent can expect. Poor leaders make good corps commanders under Army supervision (probably Johnston or Beauregard). Most importantly, don't expose leaders to combat; they are your only advantage per se, so don't throw them away uselessly.

Confederate Strategy

While you're organizing, how do you keep Southern soil free of bluecoats? And, after the Union is geared up, what can you do to disrupt his plans?

For several reasons the first question is much easier to answer than the second. In the early game the Union player is virtually forced to restrict his gains, since overextension could result in the loss of them all. If he is imprudent about weakening himself by spreading his strength all over the map, consolidate and destroy his forces in detail. A reasonable show of force should keep the Federals out of Richmond for at least one year, while his gains should be modest at best in the west due simply to the amount of terrain he has to cover. Memphis or Nashville will be taken by mid-1862, and you can do

very little about it, aside from making the struggles sufficiently costly and time consuming. Fortify and garrison those cities early.

Union amphibious strategy is virtually foolproof, so don't be surprised if it is successful nine times out of 10. The east coast cities will likely be taken from you or rendered useless within the first 10 to 12 months (except, possibly, for Charleston). At best you should limit his advances by retaining a reserve in Raleigh to railroad to trouble spots. By the time you can send an Army or corps during mid-game, Union strength will probably enforce a stand-off. Your units can threaten supply lines and force him to remain on the coast.

The western game is something else again. Each major city is on an easily accessible river (if and when Kentucky goes Union), allowing the Federal to steam right up to them. When his army becomes numerous, Confederate retention of any of these cities will be difficult. Fortifying and garrisoning are probably the best means of denying them to your opponent, Fortresses in New Orleans and Memphis, in particular, are called for. A 30 SP garrison and a depot of 20 supply points will hold for a long time. They may not contribute to supply, but they won't contribute to Federal Political Points for awhile either. Additionally the Federal player cannot leave these forces in his rear to cut his supply lines, and these sieges will siphon off a great many of his troops. It is also a good idea to leave an average leader with the garrison to conduct Attacks from March if the Federal investing force becomes small enough. The moral then is "Make any Union victory costly and time consuming." Make the Mississippi a fortified serpent; it will pay off in Union time expenditure if nothing else.

Lastly, one must consider the defense of Richmond during mid- and late-game. Obviously, a fortress is needed, plus a large garrison, a dependable commander, and a wellstocked depot. More importantly, make sure you pull Lee out of the cup. The Army of Northern Virginia (ANV) and five corps constitute a formidable force to launch at anything, requiring virtually the entire Army of the Potomac to invest Richmond to have any chance of successful siege. In lieu of Lee, however, Beauregard and Johnston will have to do. Keep the ANV consolidated, and block Union movement using the east-west rivers to discourage attack. Placing cavalry corps on the flanks will stop indirect maneuvers. Attack only when a Federal unit sticks its neck out by its lonesome, when odds are favorable, and on the 1 intensity CRT whenever possible. The Union can afford 1-1 losses (or even 2-1 losses); you cannot.

Quibbles

Being a Civil War buff, I am inclined to think that some leaders have been slighted, but these are my personal prejudices so I'll say no more. By and large, despite some mistakes requiring an errata sheet [q.v., page 18], this is one of SPI's best efforts as an accurate simulation of the American Civil War.